



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 21, 2003

Ms. Rebecca L. Payne
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Human Services
P.O. Box 149030
Austin, Texas 78714-9030

OR2003-7525

Dear Ms. Payne:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 189752.

The Texas Department of Human Services (the "department") received a request for information concerning the investigation of a specified incident involving the requestor and another department employee. You state that the majority of the responsive information is being released to the requestor. You claim, however, that a portion of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.117 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the department has not sought an open records decision from this office within the ten business day time period prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a), (b). Furthermore, you did not submit the information required under section 552.301(e) to this office within the fifteen business day period mandated under that section. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *City of Houston v. Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co.*, 673 S.W.2d 316, 323

¹In your letter to this office of August 14, 2003, you also raised sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, 552.111, and 552.116 of the Government Code. In your subsequent submission of August 21, 2003, you state that the department no longer intends to claim these exceptions to disclosure for the submitted information.

(Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). The governmental body must show a compelling interest to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* Normally, a compelling interest exists when some other source of law makes the information confidential or when third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). However, as sections 552.101 and 552.117 are mandatory exceptions to disclosure that cannot be waived by the governmental body, we will address your claims under these provisions.

Section 552.117 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who timely elect to keep this information confidential pursuant to section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117 must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). The submitted documents contain the home telephone numbers and social security numbers of department employees. You state that several of the employees timely elected to keep their home telephone numbers and social security numbers confidential, and you have marked this information in the documents. As you acknowledge, the requestor has a special right of access to his own social security number pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023 (providing a person a special right of access to information that is excepted from public disclosure under laws intended to protect the person's own privacy interest as the subject of the information). Based on your representations, we find that the department must withhold the marked social security numbers pursuant to section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

We note that the remaining social security numbers of department employees other than the requestor may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.² A social security number may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the remaining social security numbers are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained

²Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential.

or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In summary, the department must withhold the home telephone numbers and social security numbers you have marked pursuant to section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The requestor's own social security number must be released pursuant to the requestor's right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code. The remaining social security numbers in the submitted documents may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law. The remainder of the submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'D. Saldivar', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

David R. Saldivar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DRS/seg

Ref: ID# 189752

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Fernando Becerra, Jr.
202 Garrett Run
Austin, Texas 78753
(w/o enclosures)